

PROTOCOL 2

Today, on 09.08.2018 from 09:00 hours the Jury continued its work for the execution of Order No ПД 22-985/13.06.2018 of the Mayor of the Municipality of Veliko Tarnovo in connection with a competition for a Project with subject-matter: COMPETITION FOR A NEW URBAN CENTER – VELIKO TARNOVO with number in the Register of Public Procurements 00073-2018-0018 and with an address of the profile of the Buyer: <https://www.veliko-tarnovo.bg/bg/profil-na-kupuvacha/582/>.

CHAIRMAN: Prof. Dr. GEORGI STANISHEV;

AND MEMBERS:

1. ANDREA D'ANTRASI;
2. ANDREY CHERNIKHOV;
3. Dr. HELLE JUUL;
4. Prof. Dr. DOMINIQUE ROUILLARD;
5. Andrew YEOMAN;
6. YURIY LYUBOMIRSKI;
7. NIKOLAY MALAKOV;
8. LORA BACHVAROVA.

The Jury initiated the consideration of the ESPDs and assessment of the conformity of the participants with the selection criteria and the conditions for participation in compliance with the requirements of Art. 91, Para. 5 of the Implementing Regulations of the Public Procurement Act.

In its work the Jury accepted that with a view to the equality of the participants and the marked up by the Contracting Authority in the announcement in Section IV.2.4) “Languages, which the projects or the applications for participation may be developed in” shall be accepted and the ESPDs shall be filled up in the English language.

The following conclusions were drawn at the consideration:

PROJECT No 2707 – Casanova+Hernandez Architects

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 2082 – Arenas Basabe Palacios Arquitectos SL (LTD)

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- 4 numbers ESPD.

The application for participation and the declaration are with a scanned signature in hard copy. The presented ESPDs are in Spanish language but they are signed with an electronic signature, respectively of: Luis Palacios Labrador, Enrique Arenas Laorga (personal and that of the Company as a representative) and Luis Basabe Montalvo.

The participant should present signed in hard copy or with an electronic signature as they are in an electronic variant: An application for participation and a declaration – Model forms 1 and 2. The same should be signed by Enrique Arenas Laorga in his capacity of a representative.

With regard to the presented ESPDs the same should be handed over in the Bulgarian or in the English languages, which are the two languages marked up by the Contracting Authority as

admissible in the competition. The new ESPDs also should be signed with an electronic signature.

PROJECT No 2685 – Diego Terna;

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed .

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 3761 – Tsvetomir Tsenkov

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 9177 – OVO GRABCHEVSKI ARCHITECTS

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;

- Declaration Form No 2;
Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The participant has presented an ESPD, in which he omitted to indicate whether he satisfies the selection criteria, namely whether there is a person in the team who is a diplomaed architect. In this manner the model form is not filled up appropriately and a new such is to be presented with correctly filled up information.

PROJECT No 1844 – Interval Architects

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation – signed with a scanned signature Form No 1;
- Declaration – signed with a scanned signature Form No 2;
- ESPD – not signed.

The Participant does not satisfy the set up conditions and selection criteria as the Application for Participation and the Declaration are with a scanned signature. The presented ESPD is not signed.

The Participant should present a signed document in hard copy or with an electronic signature if the documents are in an electronic variant: ESPD, Application for Participation and Declaration – Model forms 1 and 2.

PROJECT No 2927 – Rositsa Nikiforova

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
Signed.
- Other documents.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 2285 – Sunday Group LTD

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 9552 – ES EN 1 EOOD (LTD)

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- Additional information consultants.

Signed .

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 1800 – Claudio Nardi

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;

- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 4134 – Association – Maya Shopova, Borislav Angelov and Don Toromanov.

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- Agreement for creation of an association.

Signed .

On an electronic carrier:

- Four numbers of ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 1344 – PIN ARCHITECTS EOOD – Desislava Parlapanska

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;

Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 5912 – ADA- Architectural and Design Agency AD (JSC)

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature by Radomira Damyanova. It was established at a reference made in the Commercial Register that ADA – Architectural and Design Agency AD is represented by three persons – Radomira Damyanova, Kristiana Nikolova and Ivo Pantaleev.

The Participant does not satisfy the conditions set up as the Application for Participation, the Declaration and the ESPD ca signed only by one of the persons representing it.

The Participant should present signed in hard copy or with an electronic signature if they are in an electronic variant ESPDs also by the remaining two persons representing it.

PROJECT No 5509 – NUC_VT_BG DZZD (Company under the Obligations and Contracts Act)

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- Agreement for creation of an association;
- 3 numbers of ESPD, signed electronically by Nikolay Stoyanov and Yordan Kutev.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Application for Participation and the Declaration are signed in hard copy and after that they are presented as a scanned copy, which is in conflict with the requirements of the Contracting Authority, in conformity with which when documents are presented in an electronic variant, they should be signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant should present an Application for Participation and a Declaration signed in hard copy or on an electronic carrier signed with an electronic signature.

PROJECT No 5190 – Özer Yurgen Mimarlik LTD

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- A list of the team.

Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 3079 – Am Atrium LTD

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;

Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The electronic ESPD signed with an electronic signature is in a format which does not allow for its opening and considering its contents. The Participant should either present a new ESPD, which may be opened on a computer without special software or cooperate for the opening of the file presented providing the programme needed for the purpose or in another appropriate manner.

PROJECT No 8470 – Maria Flaccavento

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- Agreement for creation of an association;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 6727 – Deset Arhitekti (Ten Architects) EOOD

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation;
- Declaration;
- Draft of a Contract;
- ESPD in format Word – not signed.

The Participant should present a new ESPD in an electronic variant signed with an electronic signature.

PROJECT No 3222 – Image Bureau EOOD

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD – printed version of an electronically signed ESPD.
Signed.

The Participant should present the signed electronic version of the ESPD on an electronic carrier.

PROJECT No 5938 – Association Solaris Studio and Orchestra Design

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- Agreement for creation of an association;
- Two numbers of ESPD.

The Participant has not presented a list of the documents, the remaining documents are not signed with an electronic signature. There is no ESPD for the association.

The Participant should present a list of the documents. A signed Application for Participation and a Declaration in hard copy or electronically with an electronic signature. He should present three numbers of ESPD one for the association and one for Solaris Studio and Orchestra Design on an electronic carrier signed with an electronic signature.

PROJECT No 3200 – Stephen George International Bulgaria LTD

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
 - Application for participation Form No 1;
 - Declaration Form No 2;
- Signed.

On an electronic carrier:

- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature by Tihomir Kazakov.

It was established at a reference made in the Commercial Register that the Company is represented by two persons – Tihomir Kazakov and Alexander Daw. There is an electronic signature in the presented ESPD affixed only by Tihomir Kazakov but not by Alexander Daw.

The participant should present an ESPD signed by the other representative - Alexander Daw – in an electronic variant signed with an electronic signature.

PROJECT No 5877 – Kaps

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
Signed.
- Documents in Turkish language.

The participant should present a signed electronic version of an ESPD (European Single Procurement Document) on an electronic carrier. The same should be signed by the persons representing the Company. As the legal-organizational form of the participant does not become clear, the specifics at filling up an ESPD by the various kinds of legal entities and non-personified companies should be taken into consideration.

PROJECT No 3864 – ELENA NIKOLOVA ARGIROVA

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
- ESPD.

Signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant satisfies the set up conditions and selection criteria.

PROJECT No 3470 – Association Bonev and Chayka

The participant has presented:

In hard copy:

- A list;
- Application for participation Form No 1;
- Declaration Form No 2;
Signed.
- Agreement for creation of an association – a certified copy.

On an electronic carrier:

- 3 numbers ESPD – signed with an electronic signature respectively by Ivan Bonev and Georgi Georgiev.

PROJECT No 8930 – Elina Dirba (Arhigrey)

The participant has presented:

On an electronic carrier:

- A list;
- Application for participation – with an electronic signature Form No 1;
- ESPD – signed with an electronic signature.

The Participant has not signed and attached Declaration model form No 2. The same should be presented signed in hard copy or in an electronic manner with an electronic signature.

In conformity with Art. 54, Para. 9 of the Implementing Regulations of the Public Procurement Act within a term of **up to 5 working days** from the receipt of this Protocol the Participant may present to the Jury a new ESPD and/or other documents, which contain changed and/or supplemented information. The additionally presented information may comprise both facts and circumstances which occurred after the deadline for the receipt of the tender (the project proposals). After the expiration of the term of 5 working days, the Jury shall hold a session for consideration of the additionally presented documents with regard to the compliance of the Participant with the requirements to the personal status and the selection criteria.

Pursuant to Art. 54, Para. 8 of the Implementing Regulations of the Public Procurement Act the Jury should notify the Participant sending to him the Protocol with the assertions on the day of its publication in the profile of the Buyer.

As stated in p.1.3 on page 75 in the Brief “The communication with the participants will be via email. For that purpose the Contracting Authority shall send all documents required by the Public Procurement Act to the email address specified by the participant. Such documents shall be signed with electronic signature. The Contracting Authority is not liable in cases when the participant has specified an incorrect or non-existent email address. A message shall be deemed received when delivered at the email box of the participant. Opening and reading this message is not a condition that defines the starting point of the relevant term. In case a message is not delivered due to incorrect or non-existent email address, the Contracting Authority shall certify this by printing the notice of undelivered mail sent by the e-service provider and shall proceed to publish a notice in the buyer profile as per art. 43, para. 4 of the Public Procurement Act.”

The answers should also be sent digitally via email on one of the following addresses: info@velikotarnovocentre.com and mop_vt@abv.bg. Answers that arrived after 00:00 hours (12:00 pm; midnight) on the fifth working day after the receiving of the protocol, will not be taken into account and the Participant will be removed from the competition.

Настоящият протокол отразява действията на журито по разглеждане на ЕЕДОП и съответствието с критериите за подбор.

Настоящият протокол се състави в един екземпляр.

ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛ: проф. д-р ГЕОРГИ СТАНИШЕВ;

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

ЧЛЕНОВЕ:

1. **АНДРЕА Д'АНТРАСИ/ANDREA D'ANTRASI**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

2. **АНДРЕЙ ЧЕРНИХОВ/ANDREY CHERNIKHOV**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

3. **д-р ХЕЛЕ ЮУЛ/HELLE JUUL**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

4. **проф. д-р ДОМИНИК РОАЙАР/DOMINIQUE ROUILLARD**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

5. **АНДРЮ ИЕОМЕН/ANDREW YEOMAN**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

6. **ЮРИЙ ЛЮБОМИРСКИ**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

7. **НИКОЛАЙ МАЛАКОВ**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.

8. **ЛОРА БЪЧВАРОВА**

..... Заличена информация на основание чл. 42, ал. 5 от ЗОП,
във връзка с чл. 23 от Закона за защита на личните данни.